



| ICAO

Doc 10138, A40-LE

ASSEMBLY
FORTIETH SESSION

Montréal, 24 September – 4 October 2019

LEGAL
COMMISSION

REPORT

*Approved by the Plenary of the Assembly
and published by authority of the Secretary General*



| ICAO

Doc 10138, A40-LE

ASSEMBLY
FORTIETH SESSION

Montréal, 24 September – 4 October 2019

LEGAL
COMMISSION

REPORT

*Approved by the Plenary of the Assembly
and published by authority of the Secretary General*

Published in separate English, Arabic, Chinese, French, Russian and Spanish editions by the
INTERNATIONAL CIVIL AVIATION ORGANIZATION
999 Robert-Bourassa Boulevard, Montréal, Quebec, Canada H3C 5H7

For ordering information and for a complete listing of sales agents
and booksellers, please go to the ICAO website at www.icao.int

Doc 10138, *Report of the Legal Commission*

Order Number: 10138

ISBN 978-92-9258-856-4

© ICAO 2020

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a
retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, without prior
permission in writing from the International Civil Aviation Organization.

ASSEMBLY — 40TH SESSION
MONTRÉAL, 24 SEPTEMBER TO 4 OCTOBER 2019

REPORT OF THE LEGAL COMMISSION

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
General.....	1
Agenda and Working Arrangements.....	1
Agenda Item 37: Annual Reports of the Council to the Assembly for 2016, 2017 and 2018	2
Agenda Item 38: Work Programme of the Organization in the legal field.....	2
Agenda Item 39: Consolidated statement of continuing ICAO policies in the legal field.....	4
Resolution 39/1: Consolidated statement of continuing ICAO policies in the legal field	7
(Renumbered A40-28)	
Agenda Item 40: Other issues to be considered by the Legal Commission	14
Appendix - List of Documents and Working Papers Considered by the Legal Commission.....	17

REPORT OF THE LEGAL COMMISSION TO THE ASSEMBLY

General

1. The Legal Commission held three meetings between 25 September and 30 September 2019. Mr. Abdul Kadir Jailani (Indonesia) was elected by the Plenary as Chairperson of the Commission.
2. At its first meeting, the Commission elected Mr. J. Klang (United States) and Mr. Mohammed Mansoor Al-Ruqaishi (Oman) as its First and Second Vice-Chairpersons, respectively.
3. The three meetings of the Commission were held in open session.
4. Representatives from 127 Member States and 25 observer delegations attended one or more meetings of the Commission.
5. The Secretary of the Commission was Dr. J. Huang, Director of the Legal Affairs and External Relations Bureau. Mr. B. Verhaegen, Senior External Relations and Legal Officer and Mr. A. Jakob, Senior Legal Officer, acted as his Deputies. The Assistant Secretaries were Messrs. C. Petras, A. Opolot, J. Thachet, Ms. M. Weinstein and Mr. Y. Nyampong, Legal Officers; as well as Ms. D. Brookes and Mr. M. Vaugeois, Acting Legal Officers.

Agenda and Working Arrangements

6. Agenda items 37, 38, 39 and 40 referred to the Commission by the Plenary were considered, as follows:

Item 37: Annual Reports of the Council to the Assembly for 2016, 2017 and 2018.

Item 38: Work Programme of the Organization in the legal field.

Item 39: Consolidated Statement of Continuing ICAO policies in the legal field.

Item 40: Other issues to be considered by the Legal Commission.

- 6.1 The documents and working papers considered by the Commission are listed by agenda items in the Appendix to the Report.

- 6.2 The action by the Commission in respect of each item is reported on separately in the paragraphs which follow. The material is arranged according to the numerical sequence of the agenda items considered by the Commission.

Agenda Item 37: Annual Reports of the Council to the Assembly for 2016, 2017 and 2018

37:1 The Commission noted the chapters of the Annual Reports of the Council to the Assembly for the years 2016, 2017 and 2018 as well as the Supplement for the first half of the year 2019 which had been referred to it by the Plenary.

Agenda Item 38: Work Programme of the Organization in the legal field

38:1 The Commission considered this item on the basis of A40-WP/78, presented by the Council; A40-WP/101, presented by Brazil and the United States and A40-WP/293 presented by IATA. The Commission noted Information Papers A40-WP/375, presented by the Republic of Korea and A40-WP/545, presented by Indonesia.

38:2 A40-WP/78 provided information to the Assembly regarding the on-going work of the Organization in the legal field and an overview of the developments and relevant decisions taken by the Council and the Legal Committee since the previous session of the Assembly in relation to the items on the General Work Programme of the Legal Committee, including the prioritization of items. The Secretariat further informed the Commission of the outcome of the review of the liability limits of the Montreal Convention of 1999 and drew the Commission's attention to the fact that the revised limits would become effective for all States Parties as of 28 December 2019. A large number of delegations expressed support for A40-WP/78 and appreciation for the work of the Legal Affairs and External Relations Bureau (LEB), as well as the work of the Legal Committee and the working groups.

38:3 The delegation of Brazil presented A40-WP/101, which was co-sponsored by the United States, concerning Article 12 of the Chicago Convention and the need for a communication mechanism and guidelines to support its implementation. Noting that the prompt notification and communication of alleged violations of aviation rules is necessary for States to fulfill their enforcement obligations under Article 12 and will enhance safety, the delegation concluded by proposing that the Legal Commission request the Council to create a legal and technical working group under the Legal Committee to study mechanisms to support the implementation of Article 12. The United States, as co-sponsor, took the floor to point out that the promotion of aviation safety worldwide requires cooperation and unimpeded and agile communication among States, particularly their aviation authorities, regarding alleged violations of operating rules. Therefore, the creation of a legal and technical working group to assess and improve upon the process for notification and communication between States will result in the enhancement of global aviation safety.

38:4 When the Chairperson opened the floor for discussion, the first delegation to take the floor expressed support for A40-WP/101 overall, but stated the proposal required further refinement and clarification, to include consideration of rules of the air violations over the high seas, and incorporation of the *just culture* concept. The remaining delegations taking the floor all offered support for the paper, but with the caveat by a number of them that consideration of mechanisms to support implementation of Article 12 take into account the *just culture* concept. Following an intervention by the Director of LEB, which highlighted the advantages of Secretariat formed groups from both a budgetary perspective and as a means of interfacing with technical bodies working on the same or similar issues, several delegations expressed support for the creation of a Secretariat group or task force to address Article 12 implementation mechanisms.

38:5 The Commission thereafter unanimously supported the addition of the subject “Processes and Procedures for States to fulfill their obligations under Article 12” as a new Item 3 to the General Work Programme of the Legal Committee. However, in view of existing priorities funded through the 2020-2022 budget and the lack of extra budgetary resources, the Commission agreed that work on this item could proceed with the establishment of a multi-disciplinary Secretariat group or task force.

38:6 IATA presented A40-WP/293. It stated that the Montreal Convention of 1999 represented a modern and effective liability regime which delivered significant benefits for passengers and shippers. It highlighted the benefits not only for the travelling public but also for global trade through its facilitation of the use of electronic documents of carriage. IATA remarked that 14 additional States had ratified the instrument in the period since the last Assembly and noted that 98 per cent of world traffic was now covered by the application of the instrument. It nevertheless noted that 58 ICAO Member States still remained non-States Parties and requested ICAO to provide the necessary support to enable all remaining Member States to ratify the Convention at the earliest opportunity. All States who spoke to the paper expressed their support noting the Convention’s important role and broad benefits.

38:7 With respect to the item “International legal aspects of unmanned (pilotless) aircraft operations and integration into civil aviation”, it was noted that the 37th Session of the Legal Committee (Montréal, 4 to 7 September 2018) concluded that legal aspects of RPAS operations merited continued consideration and established a Working Group to address international legal aspects of unmanned (pilotless) aircraft operations and integration into civil aviation. It was further noted, however, that the commencement of work by the Working Group is on-hold at this time due to the budgetary constraints faced by the Organization. While expressing understanding for the financial constraints faced by the Secretariat, several delegations expressed concern about the fact that the Legal Committee’s decision to establish a Working Group to address legal aspects of pilotless aircraft had not yet been implemented, in particular as the decision of the Legal Committee was made under its Work Programme item with the highest priority approximately one year ago.

38:8 One delegation noted that the budgetary constraints faced by the Secretariat were understandable and a valid reason for not implementing the Legal Committee’s decision. The delegation called on the Commission to consider the possibility of the work on the legal aspects of pilotless aircraft being initially undertaken by a Secretariat group or task force, which could operate in a single language and thereby avoid the cost of the full interpretation and translation services required for a Legal Committee Working Group. It was proposed that such a group could thus accelerate the legal work in this area in the interim, until the budgetary issues could be resolved. The Director of LEB noted that the technical work of the Organization on pilotless aircraft was on-going with the advice and support of LEB, and that there had not yet been any appeal to ICAO from States for the development of a treaty on RPAS. He indicated the delegation’s proposal for a Secretariat group was a good one and offered to proceed with the establishment of a body to interface with existing technical bodies and examine the relevant legal issues.

38:9 Among the delegations that thereafter took the floor there was broad support for the idea of forming a group under the Secretariat as a means to overcome the budgetary issues and to provide the interface between the Organization’s legal and technical work on pilotless aircraft.

38:10 With regard to the item “Consideration of adequacy of existing international air law instruments in addressing cyber threats against civil aviation”, one delegation inquired as to whether a technical group would address legal issues related to this topic. The Secretariat reported that LEB is supporting the work that is being undertaken by the Secretariat Study Group on Cybersecurity (SSGC), through its Research Subgroup on Legal Aspects (RSGLEG) to review international law instruments and that there is good cooperation and interface between legal and cyber experts at this group. The Secretariat

also emphasized that a multi-disciplinary approach is needed to undertake this work, recalling that Assembly Resolution A39-19 calls upon States to address this issue through a cross-cutting approach involving collective expertise from various aviation disciplines. Accordingly, the study on this topic would be reviewed by an expanded membership of the RSGLEG based on geographic representation, before reporting aspects concerning international air law instruments to the Legal Committee at its next session.

38:11 The Commission thereafter accepted the proposal of the Secretariat to merge items 4 and 5 of the Work Programme of the Legal Committee to read: “Acts or offences of concern to the international aviation community, including cyber threats, that may not be adequately covered by existing air law instruments”.

38:12 As regards item no. 8, the Commission agreed to broaden the scope to go beyond the global navigation satellite systems (GNSS) as had been requested by the Council.

38:13 At the conclusion of its deliberations, the Commission established the General Work Programme of the Legal Committee as follows:

- 1) International legal aspects of unmanned (pilotless) aircraft operations and integration into civil aviation;
- 2) Review of the ICAO Rules for the Settlement of Differences;
- 3) Processes and procedures for States to fulfil their obligations under Article 12 of the Chicago Convention;
- 4) Acts or offences of concern to the international aviation community, including cyber threats, that may not be adequately covered by existing air law instruments;
- 5) Consideration of guidance on conflicts of interest;
- 6) Promotion of the ratification of international air law instruments;
- 7) Implementation of Article 21 of the Chicago Convention; and
- 8) Study of international legal issues relating to global satellite systems and services supporting international air navigation services.

38:14 One delegation emphasized that the priority order of items in the General Work Programme of the Legal Committee does not delineate an order of importance, but rather that the order reflects a pragmatic approach with regard to the topics for which work can be advanced in a shorter time-frame. This sentiment was shared by the members of the Commission.

Agenda Item 39: Consolidated statement of continuing ICAO policies in the legal field

39:1 The Commission considered this item on the basis of A40-WP/9, presented by the Council; A40-WP/204, presented by Singapore and co-sponsored by Armenia, Australia, Bahamas, Belgium, Botswana, Bulgaria, Canada, China, Fiji, Finland, Gambia, Ghana, Indonesia, Japan, Kuwait, Lao People’s Democratic Republic, Nigeria, North Macedonia, Oman, Papua New Guinea, Philippines, Poland, Qatar, Russian Federation, Saudi Arabia, South Africa, United Arab Emirates, United States and

Viet Nam; A40-WP/236, presented by the People's Republic of China; and A40-WP/335, presented by the International Air Transport Association (IATA), the International Federation of Air Line Pilots' Associations (IFALPA) and the International Transport Workers' Federation (ITF). The Commission noted the information papers A40-WP/142, presented by India and A40-WP/534, presented by the International Transport Workers' Federation (ITF).

39:2 With respect to A40-WP/9, the Secretariat highlighted that the working paper had been prepared and the Assembly Resolution had been revised mainly to reflect the work completed by the Task Force on Legal Aspects of Unruly Passengers to update Circular 288, *Guidance Material on the Legal Aspects of Unruly/Disruptive Passengers* (Circular 288) following the adoption of the *Protocol to Amend the Convention on Offences and Certain Other Acts Committed on Board Aircraft* (Montréal Protocol of 2014). The recommendations of the Task Force were accepted by the 37th Session of the Legal Committee in September 2018, and by the Council in November 2018, most notably that the updated guidance material be published in the form of a manual, which was subsequently published as the *Manual on the Legal Aspects of Unruly and Disruptive Passengers* (ICAO Document 10117). The Secretariat pointed out that Circular 288 has not been discontinued, but remains available as guidance to those States which have not ratified the Montréal Protocol of 2014. The working paper also highlighted the status of ratification of the Protocols introducing Articles 3 *bis* and 83 *bis* of the Chicago Convention, and reports on the introduction of the ICAO International Air Law Course in 2017 initially available in English only, now translated into French and Spanish. The Secretariat noted the Commission's decision under Agenda Item 38 to reformulate the title of the work item on CNS/ATM Systems in the General Work Programme of the Legal Committee (paragraph 38:12 refers), and that Appendix F of the Assembly Resolution therefore needs to be updated to reflect the current title and priority.

39:3 There was widespread support for the working paper and for the changes to the Assembly Resolution, particularly Appendix E, with many delegations expressing appreciation to the Task Force for its efforts and hard work in producing Doc 10117. In response to one query, the Secretariat clarified that the word "civil" was deleted from the Appendix and Model Legislation to align with modern usage and terminologies in treaties and ICAO documents, and it remains the case that the Model Legislation is not intended to apply to State aircraft, in line with paragraph 4 of Article 1 of the *Convention on Offences and Certain Other Acts Committed on Board Aircraft* (Tokyo Convention). Another delegation questioned why the section on jurisdiction had been removed from the Model Legislation, to which the Secretariat pointed out that it was no longer necessary given that the Montréal Protocol of 2014 has now filled in the jurisdictional gaps of the Tokyo Convention. The Model Legislation in particular is intended to provide guidance on areas which are not specifically covered in the Protocol, such as the list of offences.

39:4 One delegation recognized that unruly and disruptive passenger incidents are increasingly prevalent; the delegation supports efforts to combat these incidents and the work done by the unruly and disruptive passengers' task force. However, this delegation voiced its objection to the Montréal Protocol of 2014 due to the limitations imposed on the ability of in-flight security officers (IFSOs) to take reasonable preventative measures when there is a threat to the safety of an aircraft or to persons on board, thus limiting the authority IFSOs possess as passengers under the Tokyo Convention. In addition, the language of the Protocol makes the implementation of the State of landing jurisdiction over offenders difficult for many States. One observer highlighted the substantial benefits to be derived from a broad ratification of the Protocol, noting that the concerns expressed could be resolved and may not apply to other States. This observer stated that the Protocol did not represent any substantive restriction upon the ability of States to address security matters on board aircraft and was an important tool for global uniformity. One delegation associated itself with these remarks, stating that, while not perfect in all respects, the Protocol had merit and was consistent with air law. Another delegation, in supporting the working paper, noted especially Appendix D of the Assembly Resolution and the expansion of the teaching of air law for States in need.

39:5 Several editorial suggestions to the Assembly Resolution were made by various delegations, which the Commission accepted.

39:6 Singapore presented WP/204, providing information relating to the inaugural Civil Aviation Legal Advisers' Forum (CALAF), which was organized by LEB and hosted by Singapore in May 2019. Many delegations thanked and congratulated LEB and Singapore for a successful Forum, and recognized the importance and usefulness of having an informal avenue for discussion of timely issues affecting international civil aviation. Delegations noted that the regular convening of the Forum would enable civil aviation legal advisers, through the sharing of information and experiences, to continuously update and enhance their competencies, capabilities and capacities to carry out their responsibilities effectively, and therefore urged States to consider hosting future editions of the Forum. With a view to encouraging further such updating and enhancements, Gambia invited participation to the international air law course and seminar it would be hosting in February 2020.

39:7 However, some delegations expressed their hope for financial and language support to be provided, in order to achieve even greater participation in the Forum. A few delegations also suggested formalizing the Forum by placing it within the hierarchy of ICAO's legal bodies. For instance, the Forum could be held between Legal Committee sessions as a form of preparation for the latter. Some delegations highlighted the importance of developing a competency framework for civil aviation legal advisers in order to ensure consistency and uniformity, while others emphasized the need for civil aviation administrations to have dedicated in-house legal advisers. There was broad support for the draft Appendix to the Assembly Resolution proposed in WP/204. The Commission accepted the suggestion by a delegation that the Appendix should include the contribution to the adherence of the rule of law as part of the mandate of civil aviation legal advisers.

39:8 China presented A40-WP/236, providing information on the credit administration system in civil aviation of China. Based on domestic laws, in order to enhance aviation safety and improve legal compliance, China has developed relevant credit mechanisms, including measures to sanction unlawful behaviour that endangers aviation safety and order. These measures apply to domestic and foreign enterprises, personnel and passengers from home and abroad. Since these credit administrative measures have been considered effective by China, its objective is to share its experience with other civil aviation authorities, to receive support from ICAO and contribute to the promotion of credit administration.

39:9 Some delegations thanked China for sharing its experience and information. One observer, supported by several delegations, expressed concern on the part of airlines on this subject in relation to the compatibility of this sanction regime with the international legal framework. Since this regime would apply also to foreign airline companies and not only Chinese companies, the refusal or reduction of market access triggered by this social credit scheme would be incompatible with bilateral air services agreements. The complex interactions between this concept and the international principle of "just culture" were recalled by some delegations. While one of the aims of this system could be to combat unruly passengers, several delegations expressed their confidence in the work already undertaken by ICAO in this area. China re-confirmed that the credit administration system would not undermine the rights of Member States according to their bilateral air services agreements with China. China also introduced the due process and legal basis, which would guarantee the rights of foreign air operators and individuals. The Commission took note of the working paper and welcomed the information contained in it while noting that additional information would be needed from China in the course of any future deliberations.

39:10 The International Air Transport Association (IATA) presented A40-WP/335, promoting ratification of the Montréal Protocol of 2014. Several delegations expressed support for the working paper and the Protocol, while commenting on the progress of their State's ratification of the Protocol. One

delegation, however, noted their objection to the Montréal Protocol of 2014, citing the reasons they had previously detailed in their intervention of A40-WP/9.

39:11 The Commission then agreed to recommend to the Plenary the adoption of the following resolution:

Resolution 39-1: Consolidated statement of continuing ICAO policies in the legal field

Whereas it is considered desirable to consolidate Assembly resolutions on the Organization's policies in the legal field in order to facilitate their implementation and practical application by making their texts more readily available, understandable and logically organized:

The Assembly:

1. *Resolves* that the Appendices attached to this resolution constitute the consolidated statement of continuing ICAO policies in the legal field, up to date as these policies exist at the close of the 40th Session of the Assembly;
2. *Resolves* to continue to adopt at each ordinary session a consolidated statement of continuing ICAO policies in the legal field; and
3. *Declares* that this resolution supersedes Resolution A39-11.

APPENDIX A

General Policy

Whereas international civil aviation can greatly help to create and preserve friendship and understanding among the nations and peoples of the world, yet its abuse can become a threat to the general security; and

Whereas it is desirable to avoid friction and to promote that cooperation between nations and peoples upon which the peace of the world depends:

The Assembly:

Reaffirms the important role of law in the avoidance and resolution of conflicts and disputes among the nations and peoples of the world and, in particular, in the achievement by the Organization of its aims and objectives.

APPENDIX B

**Procedure for approval of draft conventions
on international air law**

The Assembly resolves:

That the following constitutes the procedure for the approval of draft conventions:

1. Any draft convention which the Legal Committee considers as ready for presentation to the States as a final draft shall be transmitted to the Council, together with a report thereon.
2. The Council may take such action as it deems fit, including the circulation of the draft to the Contracting States and to such other States and International Organizations as it may determine.
3. In circulating the draft convention, the Council may add comments and afford States and organizations an opportunity to submit comments to the Organization within a period of not less than four months.
4. Such draft convention shall be considered, with a view to its approval, by a conference which may be convened in conjunction with a session of the Assembly. The opening date of the conference shall be not less than six months after the date of transmission of the draft as provided in paragraphs 2 and 3 above. The Council may invite to such a conference any non-Contracting State whose participation it considers desirable, and shall decide whether such participation carries the right to vote. The Council may also invite international organizations to be represented at the conference by observers.

APPENDIX C

Ratification of ICAO international instruments

The Assembly:

Recalling its Resolution A39-11, Appendix C relating to the ratification of the Protocols of Amendment to the Chicago Convention and of the private air law and other instruments which have been developed and adopted under the auspices of the Organization;

Noting with concern the continuing slow progress of ratification of the aforementioned Protocols of Amendment, including in particular those amending Articles 50 (a) and 56 adopted in 2016, and the final paragraphs (relating to the Arabic and Chinese texts);

Also noting that while a substantial number of States are party to the Protocols introducing Articles 3 *bis* and 83 *bis* of the Chicago Convention, there is still a need to further progress the ratification of those Protocols;

Recognizing the importance of these amendments to international civil aviation, in particular to the viability of the Chicago Convention, and the consequent urgent need to accelerate the entry into force of those amendments not yet in force;

Recognizing the need to accelerate the ratification and entry into force of air law instruments developed and adopted under the auspices of the Organization;

Conscious of the fact that only a universal participation in these Protocols of Amendment and other instruments would secure and enhance the benefits of unification of the international rules which they embody;

Urges all Contracting States which so far have not done so to ratify those Amendments to the Chicago Convention which are not yet in force, i.e. those amending the final paragraph to add Arabic and

Chinese to the authentic texts of the Convention, and those amendments to Articles 50 (a) and 56 adopted in 2016, as soon as possible;

Urges all Contracting States which have not yet done so to ratify the Protocols introducing Articles 3 *bis* and 83 *bis* of the Chicago Convention;

Urges all Contracting States which so far have not done so to ratify the other international air law instruments, in particular the Montréal Convention of 1999, the Cape Town Convention and Aircraft Protocol of 2001, the two Montréal Conventions of 2 May 2009, the Beijing Convention and the Beijing Protocol of 2010, the Montréal Protocol of 2014 and the Protocols on the Authentic Quinquelingual Text (1995) and the Authentic Six-Language Text (1998) of the Chicago Convention, as soon as possible;

Urges States which have ratified the instruments in question to provide to the Secretary General copies of the text and documents they have used in the process of ratification and implementation of such instruments and which may serve as an example assisting other States in the same process; and

Directs the Secretary General to take all practical measures within the Organization's means in cooperation with States to provide assistance, if requested, to States encountering difficulties in the process of ratification and implementation of the air law instruments, including the organization of and the participation in workshops or seminars to further the process of ratification of the international air law instruments.

APPENDIX D

The teaching of air law

The Assembly:

Considering the undoubted importance for the Organization and the States of the specialized teaching of air law and the desirability of fostering knowledge of this important subject; and

Welcoming the introduction in 2017 of the ICAO international air law course with the objective to enable representatives of Civil Aviation Administrations, airports and air navigation service providers to support their organizations in the implementation of air law:

Invites the Council to take all possible action to promote the teaching of air law in those States where it is not yet available;

Urges the States to adopt appropriate measures which would further the achievement of the above objective; and

Calls upon Contracting States and interested parties to contribute to the Assad Kotaite Graduate and Postdoctoral Fellowship Fund.

APPENDIX E

Adoption of national legislation on certain offences committed on board aircraft (unruly and disruptive passengers)

The Assembly:

Recognizing that, under the Preamble and Article 44 of the *Convention on International Civil Aviation*, one of the aims and objectives of the Organization is to foster the planning and development of international air transport so as to meet the needs of the peoples of the world for safe, regular, efficient and economical air transport;

Noting the increase of the number and gravity of reported incidents involving unruly and disruptive passengers on board aircraft;

Considering the implications of these incidents for the safety of the aircraft and the passengers and crew on board these aircraft;

Mindful of the fact that the existing international law as well as national law and regulations in many States are not fully adequate to deal effectively with this problem;

Recognizing the special environment of aircraft in flight and inherent risks connected therewith, as well as the need to adopt adequate measures of national law for the purpose of enabling States to prosecute criminal acts and offences constituting unruly and disruptive behaviour on board aircraft;

Encouraging the adoption of national legal rules enabling States to exercise jurisdiction in appropriate cases to prosecute criminal acts and offences constituting unruly and disruptive behaviour on board aircraft registered in other States;

Noting that States at the International Conference on Air Law held in Montréal adopted on 4 April 2014 a *Protocol to Amend the Convention on Offences and Certain Other Acts Committed on Board Aircraft* and that the Conference decided not to include a list of offences and other acts within the Protocol but recommended that ICAO Circular 288 – *Guidance Material on the Legal Aspects of Unruly/Disruptive Passengers* published in 2002 be updated; and

Noting further the publication of ICAO Doc 10117 - *Manual on the Legal Aspects of Unruly and Disruptive Passengers*, which incorporates changes consequential to the adoption of the Montréal Protocol of 2014 and contains a list of offences and acts most likely to be committed on board aircraft by unruly and disruptive passengers;

Therefore:

Urges all Contracting States to enact as soon as possible national law and regulations to deal effectively with the problem of unruly and disruptive passengers, taking into account the guidance in the *ICAO Manual on the Legal Aspects of Unruly and Disruptive Passengers* (Doc 10117) and incorporating so far as practical the provisions in the Model Legislation set out below;

Calls on all Contracting States to submit to their competent authorities, for consideration of prosecution or use of administrative or any other forms of legal proceedings, all persons whom they have a reasonable ground to consider as having committed any of the offences and acts set out in the national

laws and regulations so enacted, and for which they have jurisdiction in accordance with these laws and regulations; and

Encourages States which have not yet done so to consider introducing civil and administrative sanctions to deal with less serious acts or offences relating to unruly and disruptive behaviour on board aircraft in an expeditious and effective manner.

Model Legislation on Certain Offences Committed on Board Aircraft

Section 1: Assault and Other Acts of Interference against a Crew Member on Board an Aircraft

Any person who commits on board an aircraft any of the following acts thereby commits an offence:

- (1) physical assault or threat to commit such assault against a crew member;
- (2) verbal intimidation or threat against a crew member if such act interferes with the performance of the duties of the crew member or lessens the ability of the crew member to perform those duties;
- (3) refusal to follow a lawful instruction given by or on behalf of the aircraft commander for the purpose of:
 - (a) protecting the safety of the aircraft or of persons or property therein; or
 - (b) maintaining good order and discipline on board.

Section 2: Assault and Other Acts Endangering Safety or Jeopardizing Good Order and Discipline on Board an Aircraft

- (1) Any person who commits on board an aircraft an act of physical violence against a person or of sexual assault or child molestation thereby commits an offence;
- (2) Any person who commits on board an aircraft any of the following acts thereby commits an offence if such act is likely to endanger the safety of the aircraft or of any person on board or if such act jeopardizes the good order and discipline on board the aircraft:
 - (a) assault, intimidation or threat, whether physical or verbal, against another person;
 - (b) intentionally causing damage to, or destruction of, property;
 - (c) consuming alcoholic beverages or drugs resulting in intoxication.

Section 3: Other Offences Committed on Board an Aircraft

Any person who commits on board an aircraft any of the following acts thereby commits an offence:

- (1) smoking in a lavatory, or smoking elsewhere when such act is prohibited;
- (2) tampering with a smoke detector or any other safety-related device on board the aircraft;
- (3) operating a portable electronic device when such act is prohibited.

APPENDIX F

A Practical Way Forward on Legal and Institutional Aspects of Communications, Navigation, Surveillance/Air Traffic Management (CNS/ATM) Systems

Whereas the global implementation of Communications, Navigation, Surveillance/Air Traffic Management (CNS/ATM) systems, which, *inter alia*, is intended to provide safety-critical services for aircraft navigation, has made substantial progress since its inception at the 10th Air Navigation Conference in 1991 and received enthusiastic endorsement at the 11th Air Navigation Conference in 2003;

Whereas the existing legal framework for CNS/ATM systems, namely the Chicago Convention, its Annexes, Assembly Resolutions (especially including the Charter of GNSS Rights and Obligations), associated ICAO guidance (especially including the Statement of ICAO Policy on CNS/ATM Systems Implementation and Operation), regional navigation plans, and exchanges of letters between ICAO and the States operating satellite navigation constellations has enabled the technical implementation achieved thus far;

Whereas ICAO has devoted substantial resources to the study of the legal and institutional aspects of CNS/ATM systems in the ICAO Assembly, the Council, the Legal Committee, and a Panel of Legal and Technical Experts and a Study Group, building a detailed record and developing an understanding of the issues, challenges, and concerns facing the global community;

Whereas there is a need to also consider regional initiatives to develop measures addressing any legal or institutional issues that could inhibit the implementation of CNS/ATM in the region, while ensuring that such mechanisms will be consistent with the Chicago Convention; and

Whereas the 13th Air Navigation Conference in 2018 reviewed the status of existing and future technologies enabling the global air navigation system:

The Assembly:

1. *Recognizes* the importance of Item No. 8 of the General Work Programme of the Legal Committee “Study of international legal issues relating to global satellite systems and services supporting international air navigation services”, and resolutions or decisions by the Assembly and the Council relating to it;

2. *Reaffirms* that there is no need to amend the Chicago Convention for the implementation of CNS/ATM systems;
3. *Invites* Contracting States to also consider using regional organizations to develop mechanisms necessary to address any legal or institutional issues that could inhibit the implementation of CNS/ATM in the region, while ensuring that such mechanisms will be consistent with the Chicago Convention, and public international law;
4. *Encourages* the facilitation of technical assistance in implementation of CNS/ATM systems by ICAO, regional organizations and industry;
5. *Invites* Contracting States, other multilateral agencies and private financiers to consider development of additional sources of funding for assistance to States and regional groups in implementation of CNS/ATM;
6. *Directs* the Secretary General to monitor and, where appropriate, assist in the development of contractual frameworks to which parties may accede, *inter alia*, on the basis of the structure and model proposed by the Members of the European Civil Aviation Conference and the other regional civil aviation commissions, and on international law;
7. *Invites* the Contracting States to transmit regional initiatives to the Council; and
8. *Directs* the Council to register such regional initiatives, to consider their value and to make them public as soon as possible (in accordance with Articles 54, 55 and 83 of the Chicago Convention).

APPENDIX G

Enhancing the capacity and effectiveness of States to implement air law treaties and update national laws and regulations

Recalling the important role of law (especially air law) for the achievement by ICAO of its aims and objectives and for ICAO, Member States and the aviation industry to respond effectively to new and emerging opportunities, challenges and threats to the development of international civil aviation;

Recognizing that Member States must ensure that appropriate legislation and regulations are formulated to implement, and are applied in accordance with, the Chicago Convention, relevant air law instruments and ICAO provisions;

Affirming the important role that civil aviation legal advisers and air law practitioners play in supporting their States and Organizations to implement air law treaties, to formulate and update national laws and regulations to give effect to national policies and regulatory requirements, and to contribute to adherence to the rule of law;

Considering that legal advisers must continuously update and enhance their competencies, capabilities and capacities to effectively carry out their responsibilities; and

Welcoming the first Civil Aviation Legal Advisers Forum initiative organized by ICAO and hosted in Singapore in May 2019, which enabled legal advisers, particularly those serving in Organizations that regulate civil aviation, to share and exchange views on current issues of interest to the international aviation community and on strengthening their support for their Organizations and States:

The Assembly:

1. *Encourages* Member States that have not already done so to establish positions of dedicated in-house legal advisers for their civil aviation administrations;
2. *Encourages* Member States to make use of ICAO seminars and workshops, the International Air Law Course and other similar events for the continuous training and development of their legal advisers and to consider hosting from time to time such events in their States and regions;
3. *Invites* Member States to support the Civil Aviation Legal Advisers Forum initiative and to consider hosting subsequent editions of the Forum as well as encourage and facilitate their legal advisers to participate in and to contribute to the Forum;
4. *Requests* the Secretary General to assist Member States in achieving and maintaining the appropriate competency of civil aviation legal advisers including through developing a competency framework for strengthening their role; and
5. *Urges* Member States to support ICAO's work in the legal field by encouraging the active participation of their legal advisers in the work of the Legal Committee, subcommittees and task forces, panels, working groups, and similar bodies established to examine air law issues and develop legal solutions.

Agenda Item 40: Other issues to be considered by the Legal Commission

40:1 The delegation of China presented A40-WP/235, outlining the following four reasons underlying the development of targeted and precise oversight by the Civil Aviation Administration of China (CAAC): (1) the rapid growth of the air transport industry in China, which had led to discrepancies in compliance management; (2) limited resources leading to limited oversight capabilities, as the number and quality of inspectors was not keeping pace with the growth of the industry; (3) advances in technology, which facilitated targeted and precise oversight; and (4) the need to lower the cost of regulation for both the CAAC and for industry. The delegation explained that it would welcome ICAO's support in the next phase of the promotion of targeted and precise oversight in China. One delegation took the floor to express its interest in the new approach to oversight being taken by the CAAC and indicated it would welcome hearing from other States on their approaches.

40:2 The Air Crash Victims' Families' Federation International (ACVF) presented A40-WP/434, noting that the past experiences of aircraft crash victims' families demonstrated the negative impact that delays in the payment of insurance benefits had on victims and their families and the need for improvements in the treatment of victims. The ACVF thus recalled ICAO Resolutions regarding the compensation of victims; urged all stakeholders to support the best practices of insurers in the treatment of victims; called upon the Council to make States' implementation of best practices a subject of the ICAO Universal Safety Oversight Audit Programme (USOAP); and called upon ICAO to organize a seminar in the coming year on States' best practices for the treatment of insurers/air operators in regards to compensation of victims.

40:3 Several delegations took the floor to express support for A40-WP/434 and, in particular, the organization of a seminar as proposed in the paper. One delegation expressed its appreciation for the paper and noted the importance of the subject matter, but observed that consistent with Council guidelines the focus of USOAP was aviation safety and therefore States' implementation of best practices in regards

to compensation of victims was not an appropriate subject for USOAP. Another delegation echoed this concern and also suggested that the subject of States' best practices of insurers/air operators in regards to compensation of victims might be incorporated into other events.

40:4 The Director of LEB expressed his appreciation for the ACVF paper and affirmed the Secretariat's support for the goal of full victim compensation. He further relayed that after having seen first-hand the terrible plight of victims of the downing of Malaysia Airlines Flight 17 in Ukraine, he personally shared the sentiments expressed in the paper. He noted, however, that the compensation of victims was not exclusively a legal matter and will require a multidisciplinary approach. He also observed that LEB lacks the budget to organize a seminar devoted to this subject alone and called upon the States that expressed support for the paper to fund such an event. In the alternative, he proposed that the ACVF could bring the subject forward for consideration at the next Civil Aviation Legal Advisers Forum or at the ICAO Legal Seminar, which is to be convened in the Republic of Korea in 2021.

40:5 The Commission noted A40-WP/235, welcoming the information presented and encouraging China to share information on future developments. The Commission also noted A40-WP/434 and requested the Secretariat to study the possibility of future work on the issues raised in the paper and report to the Council in due course, while considering a multidisciplinary approach. The Commission further requested the Secretariat to encourage the ACVF to present these issues for discussion at the next Civil Aviation Legal Advisers Forum or at the 2021 ICAO Legal Seminar in Korea.

APPENDIX

LIST OF DOCUMENTS AND WORKING PAPERS CONSIDERED BY THE LEGAL COMMISSION

Legal Commission (LE)

Legal Commission (LE)

Number	Title and Date
A40-WP/9 LE/1	CONSOLIDATED STATEMENT OF CONTINUING ICAO POLICIES IN THE LEGAL FIELD (09/05/2019)
A40- WP/78 LE/2	WORK PROGRAMME OF THE ORGANIZATION IN THE LEGAL FIELD (16/07/2019)
A40- WP/101 LE/3	ARTICLE 12 OF THE CHICAGO CONVENTION: COMMUNICATION MECHANISM AND GUIDELINES TO SUPPORT ITS IMPLEMENTATION (24/07/2019)
A40- WP/142 LE/4	"NATIONAL NO FLY LIST" FOR ONBOARD UNRULY PASSENGER BEHAVIOUR (06/09/2019) *Information Paper
A40- WP/142 LE/4	(WITHDRAWN) (09/09/2019)
A40- WP/204 LE/5	CIVIL AVIATION LEGAL ADVISERS FORUM (02/09/2019)
A40- WP/235 LE/6	TARGETED AND PRECISE OVERSIGHT IN THE CIVIL AVIATION INDUSTRY OF CHINA (02/08/2019)
A40- WP/236 LE/7	CREDIT ADMINISTRATION IN CIVIL AVIATION OF CHINA (02/08/2019)
A40- WP/293 LE/8	PROGRESS WITH REGARD TO PROMOTION OF THE CONVENTION FOR THE UNIFICATION OF CERTAIN RULES FOR INTERNATIONAL CARRIAGE BY AIR (MONTREAL CONVENTION 1999) (02/08/2019)

Number	Title and Date
A40- WP/335 LE/9	PROGRESS WITH REGARD TO PROMOTION OF THE PROTOCOL TO AMEND THE CONVENTION ON OFFENCES AND CERTAIN OTHER ACTS COMMITTED ON BOARD AIRCRAFT (MONTRÉAL PROTOCOL OF 2014) (02/08/2019)
A40- WP/375 LE/10	A PROPOSAL FOR A LEGAL SEMINAR IN THE ASIA-PACIFIC REGION (19/08/2019) *Information Paper
A40- WP/428 LE/11	CRIMINALIZING ACCIDENTS AND INCIDENTS THREATENS AVIATION SAFETY (06/09/2019) *Information Paper
A40- WP/434 LE/12	BEST PRACTICES ON VICTIM ASSISTANCE REGARDING COMPENSATION OF INSURERS (02/08/2019)
A40- WP/434 Revision No.1 LE/12	BEST PRACTICES ON VICTIM ASSISTANCE REGARDING COMPENSATION OF INSURERS (30/08/2019)
A40- WP/434 Revision No. 2 LE/12	BEST PRACTICES ON VICTIM ASSISTANCE REGARDING COMPENSATION OF INSURERS (11/09/2019)
A40- WP/534 LE/13	RESULTS OF LABOUR SURVEY ON DISRUPTIVE PASSENGERS, STAFF PREPAREDNESS AND CONCERNS (10/09/2019) *Information Paper
A40- WP/545 LE/15	HARMONIZATION OF AIR CARRIER LIABILITY ON DOMESTIC AND INTERNATIONAL FLIGHTS IN INDONESIA (10/09/2019) *Information Paper
A40- WP/597 LE/16	DRAFT TEXT FOR THE REPORT ON AGENDA ITEMS 37 & 38 (28/09/2019)
A40- WP/600 LE/17	DRAFT TEXT FOR THE REPORT ON AGENDA ITEMS 39 & 40 (28/09/2019)
A40- WP/601 LE/18	DRAFT TEXT FOR THE GENERAL SECTION OF THE LEGAL COMMISSION'S REPORT (26/09/2019)

ISBN 978-92-9258-856-4



9

789292

588564